

City Council/ Landmarks Board Joint Study Session
Municipal Building Lobby
June 9, 2011

Meeting Purpose: Check in on sustainability efforts relative to Historic Preservation and discussion of review of physical changes at Chautauqua

Sustainability

- 6:00 p.m. **Sustainability** and historic preservation in Boulder from 2007 to present – how are things working?
- 6:05 p.m. **Embodied Energy**
- Information on embodied energy in historic buildings, with example of Hannah Barker House
- Comments from council
- 6:15 p.m. **Windows**
- Update on Landmarks Board approach to window retrofit and replacement in historic districts and on landmarked buildings.
- Comments from council
- 6:30 p.m. **Solar Panels**
- Update on Landmarks Board approval of solar panel proposals in historic districts and landmarks
- Comments from council
- 6:45 p.m. **Sustainability at Chautauqua** and the Learning Laboratory
- 7:00 p.m. Concluding discussion, next steps, etc.

Review of Potential Physical Changes at Chautauqua

- 7:05 p.m. - Introduction
- Comments and concerns on review of potential physical changes at Chautauqua (*Landmarks Board*)
- 7:20 p.m. - Discussion with council
- 8:00 p.m. **Adjourn**

MEMORANDUM

TO: Mayor Osborne and Members of City Council
Landmarks Board Members

FROM: Jane S. Brautigam, City Manager
Paul J. Fetherston, Deputy City Manager
David Driskell, Executive Director, Community Planning and
Sustainability
Susan Richstone, Comprehensive Planning Manager
James Hewat, Historic Preservation Planner
Marie Zuzack, Historic Preservation Planner

DATE: June 2, 2011

SUBJECT: June 9, 2011 Joint City Council/ Landmarks Board Study Session

I. PURPOSE

The purpose of the joint study session is to check in on sustainability efforts relative to historic preservation and to discuss the review of potential physical changes at Chautauqua.

II. QUESTIONS

A. Sustainability:

Does City Council have questions or comments on:

1. How historic preservation and sustainability efforts are working in general?
2. The information on embodied energy?
3. The update on windows?
4. The update on solar panels?

B. Chautauqua:

5. Does City Council have questions or comments on board review of potential new construction at Chautauqua?

III. SUSTAINABILITY

Background

In 2007 the *General Design Guidelines for Boulder's Historic Districts and Individual Landmarks* were revised to better integrate historic preservation and sustainability efforts, particularly with respect to window retrofit and replacement and solar panel installation. Along with revising the guidelines, a brochure, *Making Your Historic Building Energy Efficient*, was prepared to provide property owners with information about a variety of

ways to increase the energy efficiency of their historic buildings, beyond windows and solar. The Landmarks Board and staff partnered with the Environmental Advisory Board and LEAD staff on the revisions and brochure. They also collaborated to revise the Green Points Program in 2008 to provide points for rehabilitating and retrofitting existing windows, as well as to allow for point requirement modifications in SmartRegs, adopted in 2010, for landmark buildings and contributing buildings in historic districts.

In 2008, the Landmarks Board was recognized with an excellence award by the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions for cutting edge efforts in integrating environmental sustainability into its historic preservation program practices. Since 2007, staff has made presentations on these efforts around the state and country, including at the 2009 National Trust for Historic Preservation Conference in Nashville, Tennessee.

At the June 9 joint study session, staff will provide a brief, general overview of sustainability efforts in the Historic Preservation Program since 2007, to be followed by comments and questions from council.

Embodied Energy

Embodied energy refers to the total energy used to make a product, such as a building, including extracting, processing, transporting, storing and installing the product's materials. Although a methodology for measuring embodied energy has not yet been standardized, embodied energy is pertinent when comparing the energy cost of rehabilitating or expanding a building vs. demolishing and replacing it, even if replaced with a "green" building. The issue of embodied energy has been raised in several recent projects, including the revisions to the guidelines for historic windows and doors and the Green Points Program, but it hasn't been directly measured or addressed. At the study session, several Landmarks Board members will report some estimates they've gathered on embodied energy in historic buildings in Boulder.

Windows

The *General Design Guidelines* for windows on landmark buildings and buildings in historic districts were revised in 2007 in response to increased requests to replace windows of potential historic value, in order to increase building energy efficiency and comfort. The revisions clarified appropriate and inappropriate circumstances for replacing windows and added more emphasis and information on sealing and repairing historic windows and installing storm windows.

Since then, staff has noted an increased interest among property owners in retaining, rehabilitating and retrofitting existing windows instead of replacing them. Staff and the Landmarks Board are pleased with this direction and believe that the guideline revisions have not only improved and added predictability to the Landmark Alteration Certificate (LAC) process for both applicants and the city, but also succeeded in reducing the loss of historic windows, while helping owners make them significantly more energy efficient and comfortable.

At the study session, Landmarks Board member Mark Gerwing will make a few comments on historic window retrofit and replacement, to be followed by a discussion with council.

Solar Panels

Over the last several years the Landmarks Board and staff have seen a marked increase in requests for LACs for solar panel installations on landmark buildings and properties located in historic districts. The 2007 revisions to the *General Guidelines* on solar installations have helped staff, the board and applicants work together on finding ways to accommodate the installation of solar arrays while preserving the historic character of buildings and neighborhoods.

There are a wide variety of solar configurations and designs, as well as numerous technical requirements, so the results of approved installations have been mixed from an aesthetic standpoint. To better understand current and upcoming solar technologies and design options, the Landmarks Board and staff had a training session with Steve Bauhs from Simple Solar this past February. The board and staff will continue to educate themselves about how solar panels can be successfully installed on historic buildings and in districts and also may consider further revisions to the guidelines, to refine key considerations when reviewing LAC applications for installations. At the study session, Landmarks Board chair Lisa Podmajersky will briefly discuss the range of recent installations reviewed through the historic preservation program.

Sustainability at Chautauqua

Also at the study session, Jeff Medanich, the Facilities and Preservation Manager for the Colorado Chautauqua Association, will present an overview of sustainability efforts at Chautauqua, including the Learning Laboratory. In May of this year the Colorado Chautauqua received a 2011 State Honor Award from Colorado Preservation Inc. for its efforts to develop and compare energy conserving techniques for old buildings without compromising their historic integrity.

IV. CHAUTAUQUA

Background

Chautauqua was designated a local historic district in 1978. The *Chautauqua Design Guidelines* were adopted in 1989 for guiding changes to existing buildings, including additions. They state the following about new buildings:

“...there are very few locations where new building of any kind could be added without destroying historic character and historic integrity... In general the addition of buildings to Chautauqua would be inappropriate... if for some

unforeseen reason, the addition of a new public building is considered in the future, design and siting should be compatible with existing buildings... any new building requires public hearing before the Landmarks Board...

In 2005 Chautauqua was designated a National Historic Landmark District by the United States Department of Interior. Although Department of Interior review and approval is not required for alterations in national historic districts, the National Park Service makes recommendations on preservation actions and alternatives. A letter from the National Park Service to Chautauqua, dated April 8, 2011, stated that it does not recommend new construction within national historic districts or moving historic structures.

(The April 12, 2011 City Council study session memo provides more detailed background on Chautauqua.)

Issues

The Landmarks Board believes it needs a better framework within which to review any proposed new free-standing construction at Chautauqua, as neither the *Chautauqua Guidelines* nor the Department of Interior give clear direction on when and where new buildings may be appropriate, or on the recommended scale and design character if found to be appropriate. Without such a framework, the board can only rely on the current guidelines and the National Park Service letter and therefore does not believe it can adequately review or approve a new building at Chautauqua. In addition, the *Chautauqua Guidelines* haven't been revisited since Chautauqua became a national historic district. In light of all this, the board considers a third party analysis of the district would be helpful groundwork to determine the type of physical change that is appropriate at Chautauqua, and based upon the outcome of that analysis, an update to the guidelines should be considered.



CITY OF BOULDER
Department of Community Planning & Sustainability

Office of the Executive Director • www.bouldercolorado.gov/planning

To: City Council

CC: Landmarks Board

**From: David Driskell, Executive Director, Department of Community Planning and Sustainability
Susan Connelly, Executive Director, Colorado Chautauqua Association**

Date: June 2, 2011

Re: Chautauqua – proposed work plan

Attached please find a joint proposal from city staff and the Colorado Chautauqua Association that outlines a revised approach to address the issues discussed at the April 12 City Council Study Session on Chautauqua. This partnership proposal is provided for City Council's discussion of the citywide work program on June 16. We thought it would be helpful for you to have this proposal prior to the joint Study Session with the Landmarks Board on June 9, 2011.

A Joint Proposal by City of Boulder and the Colorado Chautauqua Association / May 2011

The Colorado Chautauqua in Boulder is a cherished community asset that serves many functions. It is a significant national and local historic landmark district; a hub of cultural activity; a lodging facility; a neighbor; a park; a tourist attraction; and a gateway to open space.

Its multiple functions are overseen by the Colorado Chautauqua Association (CCA) and the city. The CCA is a nonprofit that serves as primary steward for the historic district's buildings and grounds pursuant to a series of leases with the City going back to 1898, keeping alive the Chautauqua's mission as an active center for culture, education and recreation. Two city departments also play key roles in Chautauqua's use, care and management (Parks and Recreation, and Open Space and Mountain Parks), with support provided as needed by the city's Historic Preservation Program, Public Works departments, the City Manager's Office and the City Attorney's Office. The city and CCA have a strong history of partnership. .

In recent months, CCA has brought forth key components of its "Chautauqua 2020 Plan" for consideration by the city and community, most notably its desire to construct a new multi-use building within its leasehold area and relocate the existing historic picnic shelter structure. This proposal has evoked a range of responses from the community, and raised questions regarding the appropriate framework and process by which the proposal should be considered. It has also brought forward a number of issues related to overall management of the Chautauqua area, including questions about its "carrying capacity," and the impacts of its multiple, overlapping uses. Concerns have been raised about how to strike an appropriate balance, to ensure that the Chautauqua area is not "loved to death."

On April 12, 2011, City Council had a study session focused on Chautauqua, providing a comprehensive overview of existing conditions and key issues across the full range of Chautauqua operations and concerns. The presentation also outlined several potential options for responding to CCA's request for review of a new building proposal. CCA similarly outlined a process proposal, and Council indicated a desire for a modified approach that would provide for timely consideration of CCA's request but also respond to concerns related to access, parking and program coordination.

The following proposal was developed jointly by the City of Boulder and CCA following the April study session. It outlines a collaborative and efficient approach to establishing a shared framework for Chautauqua's stewardship, including a process by which potential expansion to facilities in the historic district and adjacent area could be considered. Rather than focus solely on CCA's building proposal, it seeks to lay the foundation for continued success of the Colorado Chautauqua through better coordination of use and stewardship efforts between the city and CCA.

Guiding Principles

- 1 Work collaboratively.** While CCA and the various city departments each have specific areas of focus and specific constituencies they serve, they all are committed to the long-term success and stewardship of Chautauqua. Addressing the challenge of multiple uses and needs requires continuation—and strengthening—of the partnership that already exists.
- 2 Build on the work that has already been done.** CCA has done an extraordinary job of improving and caring for the historic buildings and grounds at Chautauqua while continuing to attract annual visitors and provide community-serving programs, per its original 1898

agreement with the city. The work completed for CCA’s Cultural Landscape Assessment as well as other efforts provide a strong foundation for collaborative planning. There is no need to start from scratch.

- 3 **Engage the community.** Chautauqua is a place of strong emotional attachment for many in the Boulder community. Whether cottage owners, immediate neighbors, preservationists, concert-goers, trail users or seasonal visitors, it is a place that is much loved. Any discussion about its future necessitates an open process and opportunities for education, input and dialog.
- 4 **Take a broad view, and balance needs.** Any discussion of a proposal to expand or construct a new facility at Chautauqua quickly goes to other issues: namely access, parking and program management. An expansion of use in one area needs to be balanced with other uses and needs, and appropriately managed. A first step should be to establish the necessary process and criteria for consideration of any expansion. It does not need to be a “master plan,” but it does need to provide a framework to balance multiple interests and needs.
- 5 **Understand trade-offs, and mitigate impacts.** One of the core needs for any planning or development review effort is to have good information on existing conditions and reliable projections about potential impacts. The process should create a shared database of information that can inform the community’s discussion of benefits and impacts related to key decisions, and provide the basis for strategies to manage and mitigate those impacts appropriately.
- 6 **Be efficient.** The collaborative process should be time-efficient, appropriately scoped and thoughtfully designed.
- 7 **Develop a framework for shared stewardship.** The current planning effort should address near-term decision needs and also establish a clear set of mechanisms and operating agreements by which the Chautauqua area’s care and management is commonly understood, committed to and coordinated in a shared stewardship model.

Areas of Focus

The proposed process will focus on three overlapping areas of interest that are critical to the long-term success and stewardship of Chautauqua. All three areas will be considered and addressed in the streamlined planning effort, as decisions made in any one area affect, or are affected by, the others.



Process Proposal

Based on the guiding principles and key areas of focus articulated on the first two pages of this document, the city and CCA propose a collaborative process consisting of four steps, that will establish a shared database and agreed upon review process for consideration of CCA's facility proposals at Chautauqua. Importantly, these work tasks will also establish a shared "Chautauqua 2020 Stewardship Framework" to guide ongoing collaboration between the city and CCA in meeting the needs of the Chautauqua area as a whole, keeping the public trust, and ensuring the Colorado Chautauqua's ongoing preservation and vitality.

1 Data Collection and Analysis *(Summer/Fall 2011)*

- 1a Access Survey and Parking Inventory.** CCA and the city have already entered into a collaborative agreement for consultant services to collect access/parking data, including a user intercept survey to be conducted this summer and evaluation of the Baseline corridor adjacent to Chautauqua. Results will be available in Fall 2011.
- 1b Program Inventory and Needs Assessment.** CCA and the city will collaborate to develop an inventory and assessment of current programs and operations that impact facility and grounds use and maintenance at Chautauqua. This will occur concurrently with the access/parking data collection being completed in Summer/Fall 2012. It is anticipated that this information will be compiled and evaluated by a consultant, pending further discussion between CCA and the city.
- 1c Facilities and Grounds Assessment.** CCA has previously completed a Cultural Landscape Assessment and Plan (the CLA) that will serve as the basis for this work task. Using the CLA as base data, the assessment will focus specifically on potential physical changes at Chautauqua to accommodate program needs. CCA has defined its 2020 facility needs based on its program assessment to include new bathrooms to serve the Auditorium; relocation of back-office functions out of the Primrose building; and creation of additional multi-use space. The aim of this work task will be to assess these needs and opportunities as well as other city-related program needs in the Chautauqua area, including assessment of potential facility reuse or additions; potential sites for new construction and potential relocation of the picnic shelter consistent with National/Local Historic District designation. This will occur concurrently with tasks 1a and 1b in Summer/Fall 2012, and will be completed by a consultant under a collaborative agreement between the city and CCA.

2 Community Outreach and Input *(Summer/Fall 2011)*

CCA and the city will coordinate efforts for community outreach and jointly facilitate opportunities for public input. At this time, two key input opportunities are envisioned, although the specific format has yet to be determined:

- 2a Community Presentation of CCA 2020 Plan / Public Input on Assessment Scope and Process.** This will provide an opportunity for the community to understand the work already completed by CCA in developing its 2020 plan recommendations; and to provide an opportunity for input regarding the Summer/Fall 2011 assessment activities regarding parking/access; programs; and facilities.
- 2b Community Input on Draft 2020 Stewardship Framework and Recommended Review Process.** The public will be presented with results from the assessments (Task 1) and draft recommendations from Task 3 (below), providing an opportunity for input and comment prior to presentation of the results and recommendations to boards and Council.

3 2020 Stewardship Framework and Recommended Review Process

(Fall 2011)

The consultants retained by the city and CCA to complete tasks 1a, 1b and 1c, will develop a concise set of recommendations to guide ongoing collaboration between the city and CCA across the three key areas of focus: access and parking management; program management and coordination; and facilities and grounds planning and management. Development and review of the recommendations will be overseen jointly by the city and CCA, and presented for review and comment by relevant city advisory boards, the CCA board and the general public. The recommendations will include mechanisms to ensure appropriate program coordination; access and parking management (including mitigation of peak period parking impacts) and a recommended process for consideration of potential facility expansion, including recommended process steps; review criteria (such as design guidelines) and mitigation standards. If deemed necessary, the recommendation may also include potential revisions to the city's lease agreement with CCA in order to incorporate key components of the Stewardship Framework into that agreement.

4 Council Review and Adoption *(Winter 2012)*

The results and recommendations from Tasks 1, 2 and 3 will be presented to Council for consideration and potential adoption.

5 Next Steps *(Spring/ Summer 2012)*

Based on the outcome of the assessment and recommendations, next steps may include initiation of a review process to consider proposed facility expansion, relocation and/or construction; implementation of identified coordination mechanisms or strategies; and other stewardship actions intended to preserve the unique character and function of the Colorado Chautauqua through 2020 and beyond.

Draft Process Diagram

